BORA LASKIN LAW LIBRARY
3 1761 03324 9442

MUNICIPAL AND PLANNING LAW

Stanley M. Makuch

Volume II

1990-1991

With the assistance of

Gabrielle Kramer

Faculty of Law

University of Toronto

LAW LIBRARY
AUG 30 1996
FACULTY OF LAW
UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO

FACULTY OF LAW LIBRARY
UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO

MUNICIPAL AND PLANNING LAW

Stanley M. Makuch

Volume II

1990-1991

With the assistance of

Gabrielle Kramer

Faculty of Law

University of Toronto

Digitized by the Internet Archive
in 2018 with funding from
University of Toronto

https://archive.org/details/municipalplannin02maku_2

MUNICIPAL AND PLANNING LAW

Table of Contents

PART II

CHAPTER V

INTRODUCTION TO PLANNING

Introduction 406

A. The Origins and Theory of Planning 407

J. Jacobs, "The Death and Life of Great American Cities" 407

Notes 411

W.I. Goodman, et., "Principles and Practice of Urban Planning" 412

Notes 419

Greenspan & Vaughan, "How the Zoning Game is Played: A Look at Land Use Procedures" 419

S. Proudfoot, "Private Wants and Public Needs: The Regulation of Land Use in the Metropolitan Toronto Area" 421

CHAPTER VI

THE OFFICIAL PLAN

(i) Introduction 424

Ontario Economic Council, "Subject to Approval" 424

Note 427

(ii) Conformity 428

Re Cadillac Development Corporation and City of Toronto 428

Holmes et al. v. Regional Municipality of Halton 433

Notes and Questions 434

(iii) The Limits of Official Plans 436

Re Official Plan of Richmond Hill Planning Area 436

Re Borough of Scarborough and the Minister of Housing for Ontario 437

Re City of Brampton Planning Area O.P.A. 75 442

(iv) Upper Tier Municipality Official Plans 444

Campeau Corporation v. Township of Gloucester 444

Notes 447

Csele v. The Corporation of the Town of Pelham et al. 447

C. The Provincial Role in Planning 448

White, "Ontario's Land Use Legislation" 448

Note 452

Union Gas Ltd. v. Corporation of Dawn 453

Notes 456

CHAPTER VII

THE PRIVATE CONTROL OF LAND USES

Introduction 457

A. Restrictive Covenants 458

Tulk v. Moxhay 458

Notes 459

Re Sekretov and City of Toronto 462

Notes 465

B. Building Schemes 467

Hyett, "Restrictive Covenants: An Appraisal of Building Schemes" 467

Megarry & Wade, The Law of Real Property 469

MacGregor et al. v. Boyd Builders Ltd. et al. 472

Notes 474

C. Modification of Restrictive Covenants 478

Notes 478

D. Nuisance 479

Walker v. McKinnon Industries 479

Cairns v. Canada Refining & Smelting Co. 481

Note 483

Bottom v. Ontario Leaf Tobacco Co. Ltd. 484

Fiss, The Supreme Court - Foreward 486

Notes and Questions 487

Rogers, "The Growing Significance of Environmental Issues in the Development Approval Process" 487

CHAPTER VIII

ZONING AND LAND USE CONTROL

A. Introduction to Zoning 489

"Houston Looks for a Heart" the Boston Globe 489

Makuch, "Zoning: Avenues of Reform" 490

Note 492

B. The Scope of The Zoning Power 492

(i) Exclusionary Zoning and the Scope of the Zoning Power 492

Village of Euclid v. Ambler Realty Co. 492

Note 497

R. v. Brown Camps Ltd. 498

	Notes and Questions	502
	City of Barrie v. Brown Camps Residential and Day Schools	503
	Notes and Questions	508
	The Bell Case	508
	Notes and Questions	522
	Dworkin, "Hard Cases"	523
	Smith v. Township of Tiny	524
	Re Hutterian Brethern Church of Eagle Creek and Rural Municipality of Eagle Creek	525
	Notes and Questions	526
	Fishman (ed) "Current Dilemmas and Legal Issues" in Housing For All Under Law	526
	Notes and Questions	532
(ii)	Discrimination and Zoning	533
	City of Toronto v. Mandelbaum	533
	City of Verdun v. Sun Oil	535
	Scarborough Township v. Bondi	536
	Notes and Questions	539
	Re Twp. of North York Restricted By-Law	539
	H.G. Winton v. Corporation of the Borough of North York	542
	Notes and Questions	546
(iii)	Bad Faith	550
	Re Cadillac Development Corp. and City of Toronto	550
	Re Wall & Redekop Corp. Ltd. and City of Vancouver	552
	City of Halifax v. Hollet et al.	555

H.G. Winton v. Corporation of the Borough of North York 559

Notes and Questions 561

C. The Administration of Zoning By-Laws 562

Polai v. City of Toronto 562

Notes and Questions 564

D. Prohibiting All Uses 565

R. v. Gibson ex parte Cromiller 565

Corporation of the City of Coquitlam v. Karamanolis 566

Note 567

E. Planning and Land Value 568

(i) The Common Law Position 568

Belfast Corporation v. O.D. Cars Ltd. 568

Notes 574

(ii) The Current Canadian Position 574

Regina Auto Court v. City of Regina 574

Re Simpson and City of Vancouver 576

Hauff v. City of Vancouver 581

Note 584

(iii) The Charter 585

N.B. v. Fisherman's Wharf Ltd. 585

Notes 587

F. Negligence 588

Welbridge Holdings Ltd. v. Metropolitan Corporation of Greater Winnipeg 588

Bowen et al. v. City of Edmonton (No. 2) 592

Notes 594

Inland Feeders v. Virdi 594

CHAPTER IX

ZONING REFORMS AND DEVELOPMENT CONTROL

Introduction 600

A. Limitations of Zoning 601

Re Mississauga Golf and Country Club 602

Notes and Questions 604

Town of Uxbridge v. Timber Brothers Sand and Gravel Ltd. 605

Note 607

Makuch, "Zoning: Avenues of Reform" 608

B. Reform of Zoning 613

Hamlin, "Section 36, Bonus By-Laws: Legislated Deal Making" 614

Soo Mill & Lumber Co. Ltd. v. City of Sault Ste. Marie 622

Sanbay Developments Ltd. v. City of London 626

Notes and Questions 629

Re Cogan and City of Toronto 630

Papolis v. Corporation of the Borough of Scarborough 631

Letter on Holding By-law and Development Control 633

Note 637

Re Walmar Investments and City of North Bay 638

Re Sorokalit and Mississauga 639

C. Development Control, Planning Act, s.40 644

Canadian Institute of Public Real Estate Companies et al. v. Corporation of the City of Toronto (Div. Ct.) 644

Canadian Institute of Public Real Estate Companies et al. v. Corporation of the City of Toronto (S.C.C.) 649

Notes and Questions 652

240953 Developments Ltd. et al. v. Corporation of the City of Hamilton 653

Re City of Toronto Site Plan Control By-law 654

Quay West v. City of Toronto 656

H & D International Group v. City of Toronto 658

Pepino "Site Plan Control Procedure" 664

Notes and Questions 666

D. Demolition Control, Planning Act, s.33 668

A.W. Banfield Construction Ltd. v. City of Oshawa 668

Note 670

E. Lot Levies 671

Hudec, "Municipal Exactions and the Subdivision Approval Process: A Legal and Economic Analysis" 671

Notes 679

Re Mills and Land Division Committee of York 680

Notes and Questions 683

Re Steel Co. of Canada and City of Nanitcoke 683

Notes and Questions 687

Pinetree Development Co. Ltd. v. Minister of Housing for Ontario 688

Re Frey and Regional Municipality of Peel
Land Division Committee 693

Re Glenworth Homes 696

Notes 699

CHAPTER X

PRE-EXISTING RIGHTS OF LANDOWNERS

THE RIGHT TO A BUILDING PERMIT

Introduction 701

A. Ontario 702

(i) The Basic Rule 702

(ii) Mandamus/Judicial Review 703

(a) Traditional Approach 703

City of Ottawa v. Boyd Builders 704

(b) New Approach 710

Woodglen and Co. Ltd. v. North York
(1983, Div. Ct.) 710

Notes 712

(iii) Appeal 712

Woodglen and Co. Ltd. v. North York
(1983, Co. Ct.) 713

Note 715

Woodglen and Co. Ltd. v. North York
(1984, Div. Ct.) 715

McDonald's Restaurants v. Humm 720

Re Revenue Properties and City of Toronto 723

Foodcorp Limited v. Brampton 725

Bucknall, "Compelling and Issuance of Building Permits New Answers, New Problems" 728

Notes 732

(iv) Applicable Law 733

(a) Zoning By-laws 733

(b) Official Plans 733

(c) Site Plan Control 733

Re. Dominion Stores Ltd. and Etobicoke 733

Re. Revenue Properties and City of Toronto 736

(d) Interim Control By-laws 737

(e) Other 737

B. Other Jurisdictions 738

(i) Nova Scotia 738

Re Governors of Dalhousie College & University and City of Halifax 738

Notes 739

(ii) British Columbia 739

Monarch Holdings Ltd. v. Oak Bay 739

CHAPTER XI

CONTINUING RIGHTS OF LANDOWNERS

NON-CONFORMING USES

Introduction 744

(i) Defining the Use 745

Central Jewish Institute v. Toronto 745

Question 748

Regina v. Rutherford's Dairy Ltd. 749

Question 750

(ii) Extension or Enlargement of Buildings 751

Adams J. Uzumeri 751

Note 754

Johnson v. Cholette 755

Notes and Questions 757

(iii) Changing Uses 758

R. ex rel. Skimmings v. Cappy 758

Note 760

(iv) Abandonment of Uses 760

Bayford v. Kolodziej et al. 760

O'Sullivan Funeral Home Ltd. v. Corporation of the City of Sault Ste. Marie 761

Notes and Questions 762

(v) Amortization of Uses 763

City of Los Angeles v. Gage 763

Notes 766

(vi) Other Jurisdictions 766

Notes 766

CHAPTER XII

PROCESS REQUIREMENTS AND THE MUNICIPALITY

Introduction 767

A. Access to Information 768

Makuch, Jackson, "Freedom of Information in Local Government in Ontario" 768

Access to Information 771

Notes and Questions 776

B. Right to a Hearing 777

(i) Municipal Councils, Police Commissions, and Boards of Education 777

(a) Planning Act 777

Spence v. City of York 777

(b) The Statutory Powers Procedures Act 786

(c) Common Law 786

Atkinson et al. v. The Municipality of Metropolitan Toronto 786

Question 789

Campeau v. Calgary 790

Notes and Questions 794

Re Zadrevec and Town of Brampton 795

Re Maple Leaf Mills and Point Edward 800

Notes and Questions 802

(ii) Planning Boards 803

(iii) Minister's Orders 803

Re Orangeville Highlands and A.G. Ontario 803

Notes 805

(iv) Subdivision Agreements 806

Homex Realty and Dev. Co. Ltd. v. Village of Wyoming 806

Notes and Questions 808

(v) Committees of Adjustment and Land Division Committees 808

(vi) Nature of the Hearing Required 809

Re McMartin et al. v. City of Vancouver 809

Re Bourque 814

Question 815

(vii) The Ontario Municipal Board 816

Ladney v. Township of Moore 817

Notes and Questions 819

Compendium: Municipal Freedom of Information and Protection of Privacy Act 821

CHAPTER XIII

ADMINISTRATIVE REVIEW OF MUNICIPAL ACTION

Introduction 826

A. The Jurisdiction of the Ontario Municipal Board 827

(i) General 827

Re Township of North York Restricted By-law 827

Kuchma v. Rural Municipality of Tache 829

Notes 829

(ii) Rehearing 830

Re Merrens et al. and Municipality of Metropolitan Toronto 830

Note 833

B. The Ontario Municipal Board as Policy Maker - The Board's View 834

(i) Member's Values 834

Re Vaughan Planning Area Official Plan Amendment 834

Note 837

(ii) Government Policy 838

Re Township of Caledon Official Plan 838

Notes and Questions 841

(iii) Planning Principles 842

Re Township of Loughborough Official Plan Amendment 10 842

Notes and Questions 845

(iv) Financial & Economic Concerns 846

Re East York By-law 7633 846

Notes and Questions 848

Re Etobicoke By-law 14508 848

Notes and Questions 852

Re Etobicoke Store Wars 852

(v) Land Value and Planning 854

Re McGregor and Scarborough 855

Forum: "The Role of the Professions in the Future Environment" in 1974 Law Society of Upper Canada Special Lectures 859

Notes and Questions 859

(vi) Minority Rights 860

Re Toronto Restricted Area By-law 348-73 860

Notes and Questions 866

Makuch, "Land uses in Toronto" 866

Jowell, "The Limits of the Public Hearing as a Tool of Urban Planning" 869

C. The Ontario Municipal Board as Policy Maker - The Court's View 877

Notes and Questions 884

	Re Hopedale Developments Ltd. and Town of Oakville	885
	Question	889
	Re Township of Innisfil and Township of Vespra et al. (Ont. C.A.)	890
	Re Township of Innisfil and Township of Vespra (S.C.C.)	901
	Notes and Questions	902
D.	Petitions to Cabinet	903
	Statement by Prime Minister of Ontario re Spadina Expressway	903
	Offman Holdings Ltd. v. Minister of Justice and A.-G. Ont.	907
E.	Who Should Make Planning Decisions	911
	Tollefson v. Twp. of Gloucester	911
	Notes	912
	Forum: "The Role of the Professions in the Future Environment"	913